Background Paper on Urban Resilience

The concept of Human Security in Colombia, Indonesia and Kenya

At the 2000 United Nations (UN) Millennium Summit, then Secretary-General Kofi Annan called for a world "free from want" and "free from fear", an ambitious vision that seems hard to reach. By combining elements of human rights and human development, the concept of Human Security tries to breathe life into his words. However, human security is severely threatened by global terrorism, natural disasters and violence, frequently observed in metropolitan areas with high population densities. The examples of Colombia, Indonesia, and Kenya reveal the existing difficulties of achieving human security.

A. The concept of Human Security

The concept of Human Security and its seven dimensions were first promulgated in the 1994 Human Development Report (HDR),³ representing an important shift away from the definition of "security" based on nation-states and military power that was used until the end of the Cold War. Stating that "the concept of security has for too long been interpreted narrowly: as security of territory from external aggression, or as protection of national interests in foreign policy or as global security from the threat of a nuclear holocaust",⁴ the report argued in favor of a more people-centered understanding of human security. The HDR identified seven main categories of threats to human security, later on referred to as the "seven dimensions" of human security: economic security, food security, health security, environmental security, personal security, community security as well as political security.⁵

Economic security requires a secure and permanent income, either from a paid employment or from public assistance.⁶ Food security exists if people at all times have access to food, by

¹ We the peoples: the role of the United Nations in the twenty-first century, Report of the Secretary-General, A/54/2000 (27.03.2000), p. 6.

² Kaldor, Mary (2007), *Human Security*, Cambridge: Polity Press, p. 182.

³ United Nations Development Programme (UNDP), *Human Development Report 1994*, available at http://hdr.undp.org/sites/default/files/reports/255/hdr_1994_en_complete_nostats.pdf.

⁴ Ibid., p. 22.

⁵ Ibid., p. 24-33.

⁶ Ibid., p. 25.

farming, buying it or receiving goods from a public food distribution system.⁷ The third dimension, health security, is defined as being protected from diseases and other threats to human health. Environmental security does not only mean to be safe from natural disasters, pollution and land degradation, but also refers to water availability.⁸ Personal security is the most vital aspect of human security for people, requiring their protection from physical violence.⁹ Community security refers to the protection of the existence of specific groups such as traditional communities or families.¹⁰ The last dimension is about political security that guarantees people to live in a society respecting their basic human rights.¹¹

In 2001, the UN Commission on Human Security (CHS) was founded in response to Secretary-General Kofi Annan's call for a world "free from want" and "free from fear" at the UN Millennium Summit. In its final report issues in 2003, CHS defined human security as "protecting fundamental freedoms—freedoms that are the essence of life. It means protecting people from critical (severe) and pervasive (widespread) threats and situations. It means using processes that build on people's strengths and aspirations. It means creating political, social, environmental, economic, military and cultural systems that together give people the building blocks of survival, livelihood and dignity". Thus, the security of people as opposed to the State is once again emphasized. In the security of people as opposed to the

B. Case Studies

The following section will apply the human security framework to the examples of Colombia, Indonesia and Kenya.

I. Colombia

Situated in the northwest of South America, Colombia disposes on a vast array of natural resources such as oil, minerals and forests. 15 However, the country has seen a large number

⁸ Ibid., p. 29.

⁷ Ibid., p. 26.

⁹ Ibid., p. 30.

¹⁰ Ibid., p. 31.

¹¹ Ibid., p. 32.

¹² We the peoples, supra note 1, p. 6.

¹³ Commission on Human Security (CHS) (2003), *Human Security Now*, OCHA, New York, p. 4.

¹⁴ Kaldor, Mary (2007), *Human Security*, Cambridge: Polity Press, p. 183.

¹⁵ Isacson, Adam (2002), *Colombia's human security crisis*, Disarmament Forum – Human Security in Latin America, United Nations Institute for Disarmament Research, Geneva, no 2., p. 25.

of armed conflicts and economic crises since the mid-1940s.¹⁶ The central government was always week, with leaders of paramilitary groups having frequently held more regional power than the national government.¹⁷ Several guerilla and paramilitary groups acting in Colombia as well as drug trade make the country a difficult place to govern.¹⁸ Generally speaking, the social situation in Colombia is one of the most complex in Latin America.¹⁹

1. Economic Security

Colombia is South America's second-largest country and its third-biggest economy.²⁰ However, according to estimates of the World Bank, 5.7% of the population in Colombia (some 2.1 million people) lived in extreme poverty (less than \$ 1,90 per day) in 2014.²¹ Nevertheless, poverty levels are falling since 2012.²² The Gross Domestic Product (GDP) per capita was about \$13,800 in 2015, placing Colombia on the 115th rank of all countries.²³ In 2015, with 8.99 people being unemployed, Colombia ranked as the country with the second highest unemployment rate in South America.²⁴ Colombia is also the third most unequal country in Latin America and tenth in the world.²⁵ Furthermore, these factors as well as an inadequate infrastructure and the uncertain security situation hinder economic development.²⁶

2. Food Security

The most alarming threats to food security are hunger and famine. In Colombia, between 2014 and 2016, an estimated number of 4.4 million people of the population was undernourished and will be undernourished,²⁷ placing Colombia among the countries with the highest levels

¹⁶ Ibid., p. 26.

¹⁷ Ibid., p. 26.

¹⁸ Ibid., p. 25-26, 28.

¹⁹ Cock, Vanessa Suelt (2006), *The relation between human security and peace in Colombia*, Human Security Perspectives, 1(3), p. 16.

²⁰ World Food Programme (WFP), *Colombia – Current Issues and what the World Food Programme is doing*, available at http://www.wfp.org/countries/colombia.

²¹ The World Bank, *Poverty and Equity in Colombia in 2014*, available at http://povertydata.worldbank.org/poverty/country/COL.

²² Corbett, Craig (17.09.2014), *Poverty levels continue to fall in Colombia: Government*, available at http://colombiareports.com/poverty-levels-continue-fall-colombia-according-government-stats/.

²³ Central Intelligence Agency (CIA) (2014), *Colombia, The World Factbook*, available at https://www.cia.gov/library/publications/the-world-factbook/geos/co.html.

²⁴ Actualitix (2016), South America – Unemployment (%), available at

http://en.actualitix.com/country/amsu/south-america-unemployment-rate.php.

²⁵ ABC Colombia, *Poverty, Inequality and Drugs*, available at http://www.abcolombia.org.uk/mainpage.asp?mainid=76.

²⁶ CIA, *Colombia, The World Factbook, supra* note 23.

²⁷ Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (2015), Regional Overview of Food Insecurity in Latin America and the Caribbean, available at http://www.fao.org/3/a-i4636e.pdf.

of undernourishment in Latin America and the Caribbean. As Colombia's economy is increasingly reliant on oil revenues, the country is particularly vulnerable to price fluctuations.²⁸ In 2010, 3.4% of the children under the age of 5 were underweight so that Colombia ranks 108th of all countries.²⁹

3. Health Security

Compared to other countries in Latin America and the World, the health situation in Colombia is good. The infant mortality rate is about 1.41% which is relatively low, placing Colombia on the 106st rank of all countries.³⁰ As far as the HIV/Aids adult prevalence rate is concerned, Colombia ranks 76st of all countries with about 0.48% of all people being infected in 2015.³¹ The incidence of infectious diseases such as dengue fever, malaria, and yellow fever is inferior to that of the most affected countries in the world, but nevertheless, due to the tropical climate, there is a certain risk of being infected.³²

4. Environmental Security

Environmental security in Colombia is rather low. Most alarmingly in this regard is the degree of air pollution in the country, leading to approximately 15,000 deaths per year.³³ Due to the effects of climate change, the risk of natural disasters in Colombia is high, as a report of the World Food Program reveals.³⁴

5. Personal Security

The humanitarian crisis still facing Colombia after several years of conflict makes it the country with the world's largest number of internally displaced people (IDP) after Syria. The presence of paramilitary, terrorist and organized crime groups equally contributes to personal insecurity in Colombia. They regularly carry out kidnappings, extortion, assassinations, bombings and other terrorist activities throughout Colombia. Due to the conflict, over 225,000

²⁸ WFP, *Colombia*, *supra* note 20.

²⁹ CIA, *Colombia, The World Factbook, supra* note 23.

³⁰ Ibid.

³¹ Ibid.

³² Inter-American Institute of Human Rights, *Human Security in Latin America*, available at https://www.iidh.ed.cr/multic/default_12.aspx?contenidoid=634dc66b-49ff-42d9-8a88-f462e9f41e24&Portal=IIDHSeguridadEN.

³³ Larsen, Bjorn, & Skjelvik, John M, 2014, Environmental health in Colombia: An economic assessment of health effects and their costs. Prepared for the World Bank. Washington, D.C., USA.

³⁴ WFP (2014), Food Security, Disasters and Climate Change in the Andean Region, available at http://documents.wfp.org/stellent/groups/public/documents/communications/wfp264410.pdf?_ga=1.219575 193.1494556301.1476978965.

³⁵ WFP, *Colombia*, *supra* note 20.

Colombians have lost their lives and 6 million have been forcibly displaced from their homes.³⁶ In 2014, Colombia had a homicide rate of 28 people per 100,000 inhabitants.³⁷ These threats as well as frequently occurring civil unrests and urban violence make Colombia and notably its capital Bogotá an insecure place to live.

6. Community Security

As noted above, due to ongoing conflicts, Colombia has the world's largest number of IDPs after Syria.³⁸ Furthermore, among the indigenous people, the number of IDPs is equally high. Since 1997, more than 105,000 indigenous people have been displaced. The existence of about 30 tribes is threatened, emphasizing that the level of community security in Colombia is low.³⁹

7. Political Security

Despite years of internal conflict, gang violence and drug related crimes, the democratic institutions of Colombia remained relatively strong. Colombia has a long history of different parties, usually fair and regular elections, and respect for political and civil rights.⁴⁰ However, the level of political violence remains high⁴¹ and the government was for decades unable to control the guerilla and paramilitary groups operating in Colombia.⁴² Nevertheless, in August 2016, Colombia's Government and rebels of the largest rebel group of Colombia, the Revolutionary Armed Forces of Colombia, signed a Peace Accord that could put an end to one of the world's longest-running wars and improve political security in Colombia.⁴³

³⁶ United States Department of State Bureau of Diplomatic Security (OSAC), *Colombia 2016 Crime & Safety Report: Bogotá*, available at https://www.osac.gov/pages/ContentReportDetails.aspx?cid=19072.

³⁷ The World Bank, *Intentional Homicides 2014*, available at

http://data.worldbank.org/indicator/VC.IHR.PSRC.P5.

³⁸ WFP, *Colombia*, *supra* note 20.

³⁹ Diaz, Diana (2012), United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR), *Colombia's indigenous pushed to find safety in cities*, available at http://www.unhcr.org/news/stories/2012/10/50801aea6/colombias-indigenous-pushed-find-safety-cities.html.

⁴⁰ CIA, *Colombia, The World Factbook, supra* note 23. See also Colombia – Politics and Government, available at http://www.globalsecurity.org/military/world/colombia/colombia_politics.htm.

⁴² Forero, Carolina, & Fishback, Sally (2009), *Human Security in Colombia*, Josef Korbel Journal of Advanced International Studies, 1, p. 27.

⁴³ United States Institute of Peace (2016), *The current situation in Colombia*, https://www.usip.org/publications/2016/10/03/the-current-situation-in-colombia.

II. Indonesia

Situated in Southeastern Asia, Indonesia is the world's third most populous democracy and the world's largest Muslim-majority nation.⁴⁴ It is a leading exporter of numerous products such as palm oil and thermal coal.⁴⁵ However, the need to remain competitive has resulted in many employers turning to child labor and exploitation of workers as a way of reducing production costs. In Indonesia, hundreds of thousands of young girls are employed as domestic workers.⁴⁶ Furthermore, as ethnicity in Indonesia is highly diverse with more than 300 different languages,⁴⁷ the incidence of ethnic and religious conflicts is high.

1. Economic Security

Indonesia is the largest economy in Southeast Asia,⁴⁸ with a GDP of \$2.842 trillion, placing Indonesia 9th of all countries in the world.⁴⁹ However, as regards the GDP per capita, Indonesia ranks 132nd of all countries, emphasizing significant disparities and the unequal distribution of wealth in the country.⁵⁰ The unemployment rate in January 2016 was about 5.5% which is relatively low as compared to other countries in the world.⁵¹ Generally speaking, although Indonesia still faces poverty,⁵² an inadequate infrastructure and economic disparities,⁵³ the economic security in Indonesia is relatively high.

2. Food Security

Food security is a major challenge Indonesia is faced with. Notably children under the age of five are struggling with malnutrition in Indonesia. In 2013, 19.9% of all children were underweight so that Indonesia ranks 31st of all countries.⁵⁴ The general prevalence of

⁴⁴ CIA, *The World Factbook, Indonesia*, available at https://www.cia.gov/library/publications/the-world-factbook/geos/id.html.

⁴⁵ Global Business Guide, Why Indonesia? Available at

http://www.gbgindonesia.com/en/main/why_indonesia/why_indonesia.php.

⁴⁶ Human Rights Watch (HRW) (2012), *World Report 2012: Indonesia*, available at https://www.hrw.org/world-report/2012/country-chapters/indonesia.

⁴⁷ BBC News (2016), *Indonesia profile – overview*, available at http://www.bbc.com/news/world-asia-pacific-14921239.

⁴⁸ CIA, The World Factbook, Indonesia, supra note 44.

⁴⁹ Ibid.

⁵⁰ Ibid.

⁵¹ Trading Economics, *Indonesia Unemployment Rate*, available at http://www.tradingeconomics.com/indonesia/unemployment-rate.

⁵² In 2013, the poverty rate was about 11%. See The World Bank (2014), *Reducing Extreme Poverty in Indonesia*, available at http://www.worldbank.org/en/country/indonesia/brief/reducing-extreme-poverty-in-indonesia.

⁵³ CIA, *The World Factbook, Indonesia, supra* note 44.

⁵⁴ Ibid.

undernourishment was about 8% in 2015⁵⁵ and 87 million Indonesians are vulnerable to food insecurity.⁵⁶ With about 37 percent, Indonesia has the fifth-highest number of stunted children in the world.⁵⁷

3. Health Security

Indonesia's health security is threatened by infectious diseases such as bacterial diarrhea, hepatitis A, typhoid fever, dengue fever and malaria.⁵⁸ The infant mortality rate is about 23.5 deaths per 1,000 live births, placing Indonesia 71st in the world.⁵⁹ As far as the adult HIV/AIDS prevalence rate is concerned, Indonesia also ranks 71st with 0.48% infected people in 2015.

4. Environmental Security

As far as environmental security is concerned, Indonesia is currently the third-largest emitter of greenhouse gases after the United States and China,⁶⁰ leading to air pollution and other environmental threats. Furthermore, Indonesia is the country with the most volcanoes in the world which also constitutes a threat to human beings and the environment.⁶¹ Other threats to environmental security include deforestation, water pollution from industrial wastes as well as sewage.⁶² However, Indonesia is party to several international environmental agreements such as the Biodiversity Convention, the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change as well as the Kyoto Protocol.

5. Personal Security

Violence against religious minorities⁶³ as well as Islamist suicide attacks⁶⁴ constitute the major threats to personal security. In 2010, 216 cases of religious attacks were recorded,⁶⁵ leading not only to an important number of casualties, but also to the intimidation of the Christian

⁵⁵ The World Bank, *Prevalence of undernourishment 2015*, available at http://data.worldbank.org/indicator/SN.ITK.DEFC.ZS.

⁵⁶ Winata, Jerry (2014), World Food Programme, *10 Facts About Malnutrition in Indonesia*, available at https://www.wfp.org/stories/10-facts-about-malnutrition-indonesia.

⁵⁷ Ibid.

⁵⁸ CIA, *The World Factbook, Indonesia, supra* note 44.

⁵⁹ Ibid.

⁶⁰ MacLean, Dana (2014), Al Jazeera, *Palm oil fuels Indonesia deforestation*, available at http://www.aljazeera.com/indepth/features/2014/04/palm-oil-fuels-indonesia-deforestation-indigenous-displa-201443145636809366.html.

⁶¹ CIA, The World Factbook, Indonesia, supra note 44.

⁶² Ihid

⁶³ HRW (2013), *Indonesia: Religious Minorities Targets of Rising Violence*, available at https://www.hrw.org/news/2013/02/28/indonesia-religious-minorities-targets-rising-violence.

⁶⁴ HRW (2012), World Report 2012: Indonesia, supra note 46.

⁶⁵ Ibid.

minority.⁶⁶ Therefore, with regard to the frequently occurring outbursts of violence in Indonesia, terrorism and attacks against political activists, the country cannot be said to be politically secure.

6. Community Security

Indonesia's attempt to remain competitive in the economic sector leads in large parts to the ignorance of indigenous people's rights. ⁶⁷ In order to come up to the demand for palm oil and energy in Indonesia, local communities are displaced to other regions in the country, ⁶⁸ leading also to conflicts over land and resources. In 2013, more than 8,000 land conflicts took place in Indonesia, ⁶⁹ emphasizing the insecurity in Indonesia.

7. Political Security

For over 30 years, Dictator General Suharto imposed authoritarian rule on people in Indonesia. After an upheaval in 1998, he was unseated, paving the way for the transition to democracy. Indonesia's government still fails to address religious and ethnic violence in Indonesia. In 2004, the first direct presidential elections were held. However, the country is still faced with political corruption and human rights violations. Political activists expressing their views, holding demonstrations and raising separatist flags are imprisoned, revealing the government's failure to guarantee freedom of expression. Although committing serious human rights abuses, members of Indonesia's security forces often remain unpunished. Furthermore, the Indonesian government is still unable to effectively address religious and ethnic violence in Indonesia.

III. Kenya

Kenya is a country with one of the highest population growth rates in the world. It is further characterized by a high level of ethnic diversity with at least nine different ethnic groups living

⁶⁶ Lamb, Kate (23.10.2015), The Guardian, *Religious violence flares in Indonesia as mob torches Aceh church*, available at https://www.theguardian.com/world/2015/oct/23/religious-violence-flares-in-indonesia-as-mobtorches-aceh-church.

⁶⁷ MacLean, Dana (2014), *Palm oil fuels Indonesia deforestation*, supra note 60.

⁶⁸ Ibid.

⁶⁹ Ibid.

⁷⁰ BBC News (2016), *Indonesia profile – overview, supra* note 47.

⁷¹ HRW (2012), World Report 2012: Indonesia, supra note 46.

⁷² Ibid.

in Kenya.⁷³ Bordered by Somalia, Ethiopia, South Sudan, Uganda and Tanzania, Kenya has become an important hub for irregular migration as a destination.

1. Economic Security

Kenya's economic situation is unstable. With a national GDP of \$141.6 billion in 2015, the country ranked 75th of all countries. However, similar to the example of Indonesia, as regards the GDP per capita, Kenya ranks 186th of all countries, emphasizing significant disparities and the unequal distribution of wealth in the country.⁷⁴ Kenya remains heavily dependent on international donors and the country's economic growth is threatened by weak governance, civil unrest, and corruption.⁷⁵ As far as the unemployment rate is concerned, Kenya ranks 197th, with a rate of 40% people being jobless in 2013.⁷⁶ The number of people below the poverty line is equally alarming; in 2012, 43.4% of all Kenyans were considered poor.⁷⁷ Thus, the level of economic security in Kenya is extremely low.

2. Food Security

Food security is another major problem in Kenya. In 2015, 21% of all people were considered undernourished.⁷⁸ 11% of all children under the age of five years were considered underweight, so that Kenya ranks 42nd of all countries.⁷⁹

3. Health Security

Health security in Kenya is equally low. Notably life-threatening diseases constitute a severe threat to human beings.⁸⁰ Infectious diseases of the country include bacterial and protozoal diarrhea, hepatitis A, typhoid fever, malaria, dengue fever, and Rift Valley fever.⁸¹ The HID/AIDS adult prevalence rate is equally high, with about 5.91%, the country ranks 13th of all

75 Ibid.

⁷³ CIA, *The World Factbook, Kenya*, available at https://www.cia.gov/library/publications/the-world-factbook/geos/ke.html.

⁷⁴ Ibid.

⁷⁶ Ibid.

⁷⁷ Ibid

⁷⁸ The World Bank, *Prevalence of undernourishment 2015, supra* note 55.

⁷⁹ CIA, *The World Factbook, Kenya, supra* note 73.

⁸⁰ Foundation for Sustainable Development, *Health Issues in Kenya*, available at http://www.fsdinternational.org/devsubject/health/kenyaissues.

⁸¹ CIA, The World Factbook, Kenya, supra note 73.

countries.⁸² As far as the total infant mortality rate is concerned, Kenya ranks 50th with about 38.3 deaths per 1,000 live births.⁸³

4. Environmental Security

Kenya is currently facing several environmental challenges including air pollution, deforestation as well as land degradation. Furthermore, the country is severely affected by the impacts of climate change, leading to altered rainfall patterns, variability and extreme weather events such as droughts, floods and sea level rise.⁸⁴

5. Personal Security

Kenya has historically always witnessed high levels of violence, especially politically-motivated crimes are committed frequently.⁸⁵ At over 7,2000, Kenya had the 12th highest rate of reported fatalities associated with political violence in 2013.⁸⁶ Furthermore, urban violence is a serious problem in Kenya. Notably in the big cities such as Nairobi and Mombasa, armed carjackings, burglaries, kidnappings, and other criminal attacks are the biggest threats to personal security.⁸⁷ Another major risk that Kenyan people are faced with is terrorism. Since the 2013 attack on Nairobi's Westgate mall with 67 victims, multiple terror attacks have occurred, committed by the Somalia-based group al-Shabaab.⁸⁸ All in all, the personal security situation in Kenya is tenuous.

6. Community Security

Being a country of great ethnic diversity, Kenya has always witnessed many ethnic conflicts. Notably indigenous peoples suffer from attacks by armed groups, supported by the Kenyan government.⁸⁹

7. Political Security

83 Ibid.

⁸² Ibid.

⁸⁴ Ministry of Environmental Education and Awareness Initiative, *National Environmental Education and Awareness Initiative*, available at http://www.environment.go.ke/?p=91.

⁸⁵ Armed Conflict Location & Event Dataset (2013), *Kenya*, available at http://www.acleddata.com/wp-content/uploads/2013/12/ACLED-Country-Report_Kenya_December-2013.pdf.

⁸⁶ Ibid.

⁸⁷ OSAC (2016), *Kenya 2016 Crime & Safety Report*, available at https://www.osac.gov/pages/ContentReportDetails.aspx?cid=19607.

⁸⁸ CIA, *The World Factbook, Kenya, supra* note 73.

⁸⁹ Minority Rights Group International (2012), *World Directory of Minorities and Indigenous Peoples – Kenya,* available at http://www.refworld.org/docid/4954ce2a30.html.

As far as the political situation is concerned, Kenya's institutions rank among the most corrupt in the world. Although the parliament is undertaking measures to stop corruption, public trust in institutions is eroded. As noted above, political violence is another main problem in Kenya, revealing that people are not allowed to exercise their fundamental right to freedom of expression. In 2010, the International Criminal Court (ICC) has opened investigations against Kenya, focusing on alleged crimes against humanity committed in the context of post-election violence in Kenya in 2007/2008. The 2013 general elections in Kenya proceeded without mass violence, which could constitute a step towards political stability in Kenya.

C. Recommendations for further research

Based on the observations outlined above, it would be interesting to see how the concept of human security could be implemented in the three examples of Colombia, Indonesia and Kenya. Each country is struggling with different social, economic and political problems, and researchers should examine whether the concept of human security provides an adequate answer to these challenges.

.

⁹⁰ Hanson, Stephanie (2008), *Understanding Kenya's Politics*, Council on Foreign relations, available at http://www.cfr.org/kenya/understanding-kenyas-politics/p15322.

⁹¹ Ihid

⁹² ICC, Situation in the Republic of Kenya, ICC-01/09.

⁹³ Elder, Claire, Stigant, Susan, & Claes, Jonas (2014), *Elections and Violent Conflict in Kenya*, United States Institute of Peace, available at https://www.usip.org/sites/default/files/PW101-Elections-and-Violent-Conflict-in-Kenya-Making-Prevention-Stick.pdf.